

December 03, 2025 Meeting Minutes

Date

03 Dec 2025

Planning Board Members

Present

- Robert Bellinger (Planning Board Chair)
- Rebecca Harclerode (Deputy Planning Board Chair)
- John Ross
- Craig Dombrowski
- George Weidler
- Jon Hardy
- Jeremy Steuhl (Planning Board Secretary)
- Andrew Howard (Planning Board Attorney)
- Michelle Mormile (Town Engineer)

Absent

- Brian Molinski
- Stephen Thibeault

Participants

- Pat Prendergast
- Jeff Hubbard
- Frank Doherty
- Kayla Shea
- Samantha Cummings
- Bob Beckmann

Correspondence

- Applicants for the following applications did contact me and said they would not be ready to return to the Planning Board this month with updates for their projects:
 - **PB-152 - Special Use Permit [Fumbo Realty, LLC]**
 - **PB-172 - Subdivision [Charles & Felicia Webber]**
 - **PB-174 - Special Use Permit [Sunfair Farm LLC]**
 - **PB-186 - Special Use Permit [Ian Bullis]**

Applications

Public Hearing

- **PB-156 - Site Plan Approval [Chansog Kim]**
A Site Plan Review for construction of a commercial greenhouse for cannabis growing at 3461 State Route 9 Hudson, 140.-1-17.200.

Old Business

- None

New Business

- **PB-189 - Subdivision [Red Wing Properties]**
A Major Subdivision application to create 2 parcels at 1356 County Route 19 at 192.00-1-21.3.
- **PB-191 - Special Use Permit [Beckmann Land Company LLC]**
PB-193 - Site Plan Approval [Beckmann Land Company LLC]
A Special Use Permit and Site Plan Review to increase the size of the existing non-conforming building by more than 50% and the construction of an accessory structure level 2 building (50'x100').

Minutes

- Meeting started with the Pledge of Allegiance at 19:00.
- Roll call at 19:01.
- Motion to accept minutes from 05 Nov 2025 was made by George Weidler, 2nd by John Ross.
- All in favor. Motion approved.

PB-156 - Site Plan Approval [Chansog Kim]

- Motion to open the public hearing for application PB-156 was made by John Ross, 2nd by George Weidler. All in favor. Motion approved.
- Public hearing opened at 19:02.
- Pat Prendergast, along with Mr. Frank Kim and Jeff Hubbard presented updates to the public for their application for Site Plan Review for construction of a commercial greenhouse for cannabis growing at 3461 State Route 9 Hudson, 140.-1-17.200
- Applicant provided receipts of notifying abutting neighbors.
Pat Prendergast put up an easel with paper copy of the plans and presented the application to the public.
- A digital copy of the plans were also presented on the screen for all to see as well.
- Pat Prendergast pointed out how you can't see the site since it's completely hidden by woods. There's a 50' ROW to access the driveway.
- Would like to construct a greenhouse with small office, secured by a 8' fence on the 10 acre property. They have a OCM license from NYS to grow cannabis.
- No retail involved. Only farm operation of growing, drying and packaging the cannabis to send to distributor.
- State of the art odor control will be installed so that the odors don't leave the property.
- Robert Bellinger opened for Public comment.

Public comment:

- Scott Watson, native of Columbia County. Purchased a 1 1/2 acre at 3517 Rt 9. He didn't get notified. Wants to know how close the his property is to the project site.
 - Investigated, he is not an abutting property owner.
- Emily Kress, from Orchard Rd. She spoke with the mobile home park residents and there was supposed to be a letter that was sent.
 - The board has not received anything.
- Barbara Jacque had concerns about traffic coming in and out.
 - There's only 5 employees planned and they will likely be in and out 1-2 times a day. Like 3-4 cars. Maybe once every 2 weeks a box truck will come onsite. Staff will come in the morning, work and leave about 3pm.

- Pam would like to know about the odor control.
 - Nearest mobile home is 750ft away. They are purchasing 2 levels of air scrubbing, which will cleanse the air and they are doing this so the neighbors don't experience the smell.
- Tom Alvarez, has a letter with 82 signatures of residents of Bells Pond Community that oppose this application. Tom Alvarez read the letter to the board. Concerned that the applicant did not reach out to them before proceeding with their application. He doesn't have a problem with the greenhouse, but does have a an issue with the product that will be grown in the house. Tom provided the letters for the record.
 - Pat Prendergast said he spoke with Jim Alvarez.

Letters of Opposition

- Dave Kimball, commented about a problem in the town with another farm. Is concerned the air scrubbers might not work.
- Pat Prendergast and Jeff Hubbard said this technology is relatively new and is designed to work efficiently. There's 2 stages to the air scrubbing.
- Savana Shulken, read a prepared letter. Concerned about the odor and long term exposure.
- Emily Kress, said she did speak with other neighbors who are not abutting, including the mobile home park across the street. Also spoke with someone from Galvan hotel, who was not aware. Concerned about security and crime, with people trying to break into the facility.
- Tom Alvarez, does not think that the Town of Livingston would like the reputation of being the cannabis growers of the county and how bad this product is for the consumer.
- Barbara Jacque is concerned about property values and lighting.
- Fire Chief Jahns has a relative living in Bells Pond mobile home park and there's also a farm right next to where he lives. They can't leave their windows open because the smell is so strong. Doesn't believe the scrubbers will work.
- Tom Jacque wants to know what the security is.
 - There will be security fencing and guards.
- Barbara Jacque feels it's too close to the senior living park and would be better if it was farther away. There just seems to be a lot of unknown.
- Robert Bellinger suggested to the board that since we haven't heard from the Columbia County Planning Board (CCPB), the hearing should be adjourned, not closed, until we get review from CCPB.
- Motion to adjourn the public hearing to 07 Jan 2026 was made by Craig Dombrowski, 2nd by John Ross.
- All in favor. Motion approved.
- Public hearing adjourned at 19:29.
- Pat Prendergast commented that cannabis is legal.
- Applicant will return at the 07 Jan 2026 meeting to continue the public hearing.

PB-189 - Subdivision [Red Wing Properties]

- Frank Doherty presented a Major Subdivision application to create 2 parcels at 1356 County Route 19 at 192.00-1-21.3.
- Frank owns the parcel on CR 19. Originally about 196 acres, several years ago they carved off 7 acres for Kayla Shea. Kayla Shea's sister wants to purchase this new parcel. Currently has livestock that they Shea's use, they plan to continue to use it for livestock, they just want to purchase the 19 acres to continue operating.
- Robert Bellinger commented that a driveway was still needed.
- Kayla Shea said her father contacted someone at the county to come out to look at the location of a proposed driveway.
- Kayla Shea wanted to know if they have to actually put the driveway in, Robert Bellinger said no, but the lot requires approved access. They need to have an approved driveway cut.
- George Weidler asked if the strip on CR 19, is that at least 50' wide. Frank Doherty said yes.
- John Ross asked if the concrete buildings are on the 19 acres. Kayla Shea said no, they are on the remaining lands of Red Wing.
- Robert Bellinger asked if the map needs to be updated, because an abutting property has a building on it that is no longer there. Attorney Howard said, it's not a problem, since it's not on the property to be subdivided.
- Robert Bellinger asked what they plan to do with the remaining land. Frank Doherty wants to sell it, but hasn't sold in many years. Kukon is currently growing corn on that part of the property.
- Robert Bellinger stated we need approval for the county highway.
- Robert Bellinger asked the board if we need to require escrow?
- Michelle Mormile said if you are to put a driveway in from your current property, you would need to get an easement, otherwise it does not look like she would need to review this application.
- It was agreed that escrow would not be required.
- John Ross asked if they planned to build. Kayla Shea said no, just the cattle.
- Robert Bellinger asked to set public hearing, conditionally getting approval from county highway department for 07 Jan 2026 was made by Rebecca Harclerode, 2nd by George Weidler.
- All in favor. Motion approved.
- Applicant will notify abutting neighbors and return in January for the public hearing.

PB-191 - Special Use Permit [Beckmann Land Company LLC]

PB-193 - Site Plan Approval [Beckmann Land Company LLC]

- Samantha Cummings presented a Special Use Permit and Site Plan Review to increase the size of the existing non-conforming building by more than 50% and the construction of an accessory structure level 2 building (50'x100').
- Brought up the survey and pointed out the locations of the
- Reviewed the site plan, proposing to connect 2 buildings with a 500 ft² connector. Will end up making a 5500 ft². There will be another building to the rear
- Robert Bellinger asked what the site is to be used for. Auto body and restoration.
- Using the existing curb cut and extend that to the rear of the property.
- Robert Bellinger asked about the propane tank and whether it should be bollard. Fire code, per Fire Chief Jahns said it should be bollarded.
- Robert Bellinger requested escrow in the amount of \$3000. Bob Beckmann said he would mail it in.
- Andy from Taconic Engineering commented that they are expanding to give him indoor spray booth and some other stuff that the building doesn't currently afford.
 - Intensity of use will not change. Still plan to have only 2 employees at any given time.
- Michelle Mormile asked if anything was to be washed.
 - No floor drains or anything. It's all dry work.
- John Ross asked how many parking spots.
 - 8 total, for customers and employees. There's the whole upper section that is all gravel that can be and will be used to store/park vehicles as well. They wanted to show a dedicated parking on the map, but they will use all of that gravel area as well.
- John Ross asked where vehicles to be worked on will be stored.
 - In that area. That whole site is fenced and secured.
- Discussion about the berm and potential wetlands. It's about 20'-30' berm. Andy from Taconic Engineering walked it and confirmed there is wetland on the property, but nowhere near it. Samantha Cummings pointed out the 100' wetland buffer on the map.
- Discussion about whether we should schedule for public hearing.
- Robert Bellinger asked if they would need a variance. Attorney Howard read the code and determined they will not need to, because the current building is non-conforming. They are not going to make it any more non-conforming.
- Attorney Howard confirmed that this is LDR-2 and the use is non-confirming, but is already an existing non-conforming and they are not expanding the use. Only the building is getting larger. The code talks about having a Special Use Permit submitted to the Zoning Board, but after further review, Attorney Howard determined that it's not the Zoning Board of Appeals and should lie with this board.
- Robert Bellinger asked if they did salvage. Bob Beckmann said no.
- Motion to schedule public hearing by John Ross, 2nd by Craig Dombrowski.
- All in favor. Motion approved.
- Motion to send to Columbia County Planning Board was made by Craig Dombrowski, 2nd by George Weidler.
- All in favor. Motion approved.
- Applicant will notify abutting neighbors and return in January for the public hearing.

- There being no further business, a motion to adjourn was made by George Weidler, 2nd by John Ross.
- All present voted AYE. Motion passed.
- Next scheduled meeting will be held
- Meeting closed at 20:00.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeremy Steuhl
Secretary Livingston Planning Board